

The Presbytery of Santa Barbara

Guidelines for a Process for Reconciliation or Gracious Separation of a Congregation from the
Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.)

DRAFT – as amended at the May 4, 2013 presbytery meeting. Changes recommended by Presbytery Council and approved at the meeting are no longer shown in bold italics. Other changes approved at the meeting are shown in bold italics and are highlighted on this copy. Some line numbers have changed.

INTRODUCTION

The 218th General Assembly (2008) of the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.), hereinafter PC(USA), approved Commissioners' Resolution Item 04-28 which urged (adapted for the 2011-2013 Book of Order): "that presbyteries and synods develop and make available to lower governing bodies and local congregations a process that exercises the responsibility and power 'to divide, dismiss, or dissolve churches in consultation with their members' (Book of Order, G-3.0301a) with consistency, pastoral responsibility, accountability, gracious witness, openness, and transparency. Believing that trying to exercise this responsibility and power through litigation is deadly to the cause of Christ, impacting the local church, other parts of the Body of Christ and ecumenical relationships, and our witness to Christ in the world around us, the General Assembly urges congregations considering leaving the denomination, presbyteries and synods to implement a process using the following principles:

- Consistency: The local authority delegated to presbyteries is guided and shaped by our shared faith, service, and witness to Jesus Christ.
- Pastoral Responsibility: The requirement in G-3.0301.a to consult with the members of a church seeking dismissal highlights the presbytery's pastoral responsibility, which must not be submerged beneath other responsibilities.
- Accountability: For a governing body, accountability rightly dictates fiduciary and connectional concerns, raising general issues of property (G-4.200) and specific issues of schism within a congregation (G-4.0207). But, full accountability also requires preeminent concern with 'caring for the flock.'
- Gracious Witness: ... Scripture and the Holy Spirit require a gracious witness from us rather than a harsh legalism.
- Openness and Transparency: Early, open communication and transparency about principles and process of dismissal necessarily serve truth, order, and goodness, and work against seeking civil litigation as a solution."

The rationale supporting this resolution stated that it is easy to "emphasize the property trust responsibilities of presbytery/synod oversight to the exclusion of the pastoral responsibility of caring for the congregations (members staying and leaving) and the responsibility of public witness to Christ with the larger body of Christ and the community and world." Secondly, it was suggested that presbyteries should be consistent in communicating how they will respond to

44 congregations seeking dismissal and that all parties should engage in a more grace-filled
45 exchange.

46

47 The VISION OF THE PRESBYTERY OF SANTA BARBARA

48

49 The vision of the Presbytery of Santa Barbara is to grow congregations that passionately engage
50 their community to make disciples. Our mission is to -

51 Confess Jesus Christ as Lord

52 Connect one another in ministry

53 Challenge one another for mission.

54

55 The Presbytery of Santa Barbara seeks to facilitate worship, mission, and other shared ministries
56 by engaging all of the churches in our bounds to be united in carrying out our vision and mission.
57 Naturally, the presbytery wants to retain all of its member congregations within the PC(USA).
58 However, in some cases, the desire to withdraw entirely from the PC(USA) may be so deeply felt
59 and widely held that the best thing is to honor the will of the congregation while fairly protecting
60 the interests of all parties involved.

61

62 The Presbytery of Santa Barbara is committed to pursuing reconciliation with pastors, sessions,
63 and congregations who are considering dismissal from the denomination. Whether that
64 reconciliation takes the form of dismissal, mutually accepted re-commitment to the presbytery-
65 congregational relationship, or something in-between, it is the will of this presbytery to create a
66 gracious context and process in which the will of God is sought for the life, ministry, and calling
67 of the particular congregation. All congregations of this presbytery are invited to commit to this
68 broad understanding of reconciliation with a graciousness befitting those who claim Jesus as
69 Lord.

70

71 The presbytery and congregations will be continually guided by these principles:

72

73 The Mission of God as expressed in the Great Ends of the Church is greater than the PC(USA)

74

75 We affirm that should presbytery dismiss a congregation to another Reformed body, the unity
76 of the one Church of Jesus Christ has not been diminished. (F-1.0302 and F-1.0304)

77

78 The exercise of “mutual forbearance” is of utmost importance in our process. Therefore, all
79 will treat each other with respect regardless of theological and ecclesiological differences. We
80 will pray and work for fairness to all parties in our decisions.

81

82 In matters of controversy, a larger part of the Church (or a representation of it) should govern
83 a smaller. Our system of councils in regular gradation reflects this understanding (F-3.0203).

84

85 In accordance with G-4.0207, the presbytery has the right and responsibility to assess the
86 situation in cases of conflict in a congregation. Accordingly, the presbytery needs to inquire and
87 make an informed judgment as to: the possibilities of reconciliation; what or who is preventing
88 reconciliation; approximately how many people are determined to leave and how many wish to
89 remain in the PC(USA); does the congregation understand what it is being asked to consider and

90 have the implications of leaving the PC(USA) been fully and fairly explained; and has the
91 process been open and fair to all concerned? This assessment shall be made via open forums and
92 discussion. It is important that the process of discernment be conducted in a way that seeks the
93 truth and is fair to all parties. Requests made by the congregation will not be considered valid
94 unless the presbytery has first met with and received the cooperation of the session and any
95 installed teaching elders and determined that the principles and procedures herein outlined will
96 be fairly implemented.

97
98 The example of the apostles and of the early Church is authoritative in dealing with such matters.
99 The Council at Jerusalem engaged in a process of discernment as it exercised leadership and
100 oversight over the missionary activities of Paul and Barnabas. The role of testimony, prayer,
101 discussion, deliberation, and collective discernment of the will of God were, and are, important.
102 The process by which a congregation comes to decide that it is being called by God to seek
103 dismissal and realignment shall respect dissent and should safeguard and provide sufficient time
104 and opportunities so that the will of God can be received by the whole congregation. A rush to
105 judgment is not consistent with Biblical principles or Reformed polity.

106 THE PROCESS

107
108
109 The following process incorporates these principles with the clear understanding that, in
110 particular cases, circumstances may require modification and flexibility in the interest of fairness
111 and practical wisdom.

112
113 In the Presbyterian tradition, an inter-connected relationship is assumed between the presbytery
114 and its congregations. Therefore, no congregation will be dismissed to another Reformed body
115 unless and until, at a minimum, the following process is followed. A congregation can be
116 dismissed with property to another Reformed body recognized by the PC(USA) and/or the
117 Presbytery of Santa Barbara. It cannot be dismissed to “independency.”

118
119 As noted under “Other Book Provisions below, failure to follow this process may result in the
120 appointment of an Administrative Commission and assumption of original jurisdiction in
121 accordance with G-3.0109b.

122 The Session and the Presbytery Response Team

123
124
125 The Session and its pastor/moderator, after consideration, prayer and a minimum two-thirds
126 majority vote of the Session, notifies the presbytery so it may form a Presbytery Response Team
127 (PRT) in order to engage the congregation in discussions about potential resolution or dismissal
128 for identified reasons of conscience. Once action has been initiated to form a PRT, the Session
129 shall provide the PRT with the membership roll. All deletions and additions of active members
130 of the congregation shall be open to review by the PRT to determine the appropriateness of these
131 changes.

132
133 The PRT will consist of a Chairperson appointed by the Presbytery Council in consultation with
134 the Committee on Ministry skilled in conflict resolution; and at least two others chosen by the
135 Council, including at least one ruling elder and one teaching elder. It is the intention of

136 Presbytery Council to develop a pool of members who have been trained so that they may be
137 called upon to respond quickly to a congregation **session** that has expressed concerns that might
138 lead to a request for dismissal. As a part of the PRT training, the PRT will receive resources and
139 materials pertaining but not limited to an exploration of the covenant relationship between the
140 congregation and the denomination. When the PRT meets with the Session, such meetings will
141 be moderated by the PRT Chairperson. On occasion, the PRT Chairperson may ask the
142 pastor(s)/session moderator to excuse him or herself from a particular meeting.

143
144 The PRT will not determine the merits of the concerns raised by the Session, but will work to
145 assure the issues have been addressed fairly and accurately. The PRT will promptly report the
146 results of the initial meeting with the Session and its recommendations to the Presbytery Council.
147 The PRT may then work with the Session to convene a congregational gathering for the purpose
148 of hearing from the members and discerning how many members desire that the congregation be
149 dismissed to another Reformed body with which the presbytery deems itself to be in fellowship.

150

151 The Initial Meeting of the Congregation

152

153 The PRT expects that at least fifty percent of the active membership will participate in this initial
154 gathering meeting which will be moderated by a teaching or ruling elder appointed for this
155 purpose by the Presbytery Council. The members of the PRT will attend this gathering and will
156 be allowed sufficient time to speak on behalf of the PC(USA). During this gathering the PRT
157 will ensure that the members of the congregation have been informed regarding the polity and
158 practice of the Reformed body to which they may be going, including any practical implications
159 this might mean for the congregation.

160

161 If the PRT determines that a significant proportion (estimated at more than 2/3) of the attending
162 members wish to be dismissed, a second gathering will be convened. After the initial
163 congregational gathering, at least three months will pass before this second gathering. This
164 allows the PRT to carry out the following functions:

165

166 1. Negotiate the terms of separation with the Session in accordance with the requirements
167 of the presbytery that reflect **the most current and/or future** fiscal and ecclesiastical
168 PC(USA) directives. These agreed upon terms will be voted on at the second
169 congregational gathering as an integral part of any request for dismissal.

170

171 2. Meet with the members of the congregation who wish to remain within the PC(USA) to
172 best strategize how to either maintain an existing mission presence, incorporate members
173 into nearby Presbyterian congregations, or create a new entity.

174

175 3. Meet with Teaching Elders currently called or employed by the congregation to
176 determine whether they shall remain with the congregation and transfer their ministerial
177 status to the new denomination, whether they shall remain within the PC(USA) and need to
178 request permission from the Committee on Ministry to serve in another Reformed body, or
179 whether they shall remain in the PC(USA) and have been enrolled as a member at large of
180 the presbytery. Teaching Elders shall be encouraged to review the Board of Pension
181 policies. Reasonable steps shall be taken to provide support and care to those Teaching

182 Elders wishing to stay in the PC(USA) and not desiring to serve in a congregation of the
183 other Reformed body.

184

185 4. Meet with any members of the congregation who are preparing for ministry and are
186 under the care of presbytery. Each member under care together with his/her liaison from
187 the Committee on Preparation for Ministry shall be advised immediately of the
188 congregation's possible dismissal. The member under care will be given the option of
189 being dismissed with the congregation or transferring their membership to another
190 congregation within the PC(USA). If transfer to another congregation within the PC(USA)
191 is requested, presbytery and the CPM liaison will assist the member in seeking a waiver of
192 the usual six-month requirement for church membership in order to maintain care status.

193

194 The Second Gathering of the Congregation

195

196 After the PRT has completed these functions, a second gathering will be convened. Written
197 notice shall be given by mail to all members at least 30 days prior to the time of the gathering, as
198 well as announced from the pulpit of the church at regular church services on four successive
199 Sundays immediately prior to the meeting. The gathering shall take place after 3:00 p.m. in the
200 church sanctuary to give the members of the PRT and those traveling from other places sufficient
201 time to attend. A concerted effort should be made to maximize the participation of the
202 congregation in this gathering. There shall be at least 1/2 (50%) of the current active membership
203 in attendance. An affirmative vote of at least 2/3 (two-thirds) of those in attendance is required in
204 order to further the dismissal process. The Session must provide to the presbytery a list of
205 members not wanting to leave the PC(USA) within 60 days of any vote by the presbytery to
206 dismiss the congregation.

207

208 The PRT shall conduct the gathering, which is technically a meeting of the PRT, not a
209 congregational meeting (since the Book of Order does not include seeking dismissal as a purpose
210 for which a congregational meeting may be called). The PRT members shall again be allowed
211 sufficient time to speak on behalf of the PC(USA). This meeting will be moderated by a member
212 of the Committee on Ministry, the executive presbyter, or the stated clerk of presbytery in order
213 to allow the members of the PRT to fulfill their advocacy role.

214

215 The Session will outline in detail the terms of the proposed dismissal including the financial
216 terms. A written copy of these terms shall be provided to all attendees at the meeting.

217

218 The privilege of the floor is limited to persons who are appointed by the presbytery, active
219 members of the particular congregation and Teaching Elders currently called and or employed by
220 the congregation. Others will not be heard or allowed to cast a ballot regarding the request for
221 dismissal. After a full and fair discussion, in which each person with the privilege of the floor
222 present who wishes to speak (for up to five minutes) has had an opportunity to do so, a secret
223 ballot of the congregation members will be taken on the categorical question: "Shall the
224 membership of the _____ Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.) request dismissal as a body by
225 the Presbytery of Santa Barbara to _____, another Reformed body in accordance with
226 the terms, including the financial terms as negotiated by the presbytery and Session?" This
227 motion may not be separated.

228
229 The ballots shall be counted by two elders from the congregation and two representatives of the
230 presbytery. Only ballots clearly legible shall be counted. In case of ambiguity, the ballot will be
231 counted as “No.” Abstentions count as “No” votes. The ballots shall be counted twice and the
232 results shall be announced at the meeting, and the results shall be communicated in writing by
233 the PRT to the stated clerk of the presbytery.

234
235 Within ten days of the second gathering of the PRT with the congregation, any person of the
236 unsuccessful side may contest the regularity of the call for, or the conduct of, or the manner of
237 the request made at the meeting by a written notice to the presbytery. The Presbytery Council
238 shall review the questions at issue and, if the contest is sustained, it shall direct the calling of a
239 new meeting of the PRT with the congregation. The congregation shall continue to be a member
240 church of the PC(USA) until such time as the required meeting takes place and the presbytery
241 votes on any request for dismissal. Once the manner of the request is determined to be fair and
242 regular, the decision of the Presbytery Council shall stand.

243 244 THE MEETING OF THE PRESBYTERY

245
246 The presbytery shall act in response to the congregation’s action. Following notice of any
247 request for dismissal, the Moderator will follow the normal procedures for calling a meeting of
248 presbytery, provided that there is not already scheduled a stated meeting of presbytery within 45
249 days of the congregational request for dismissal. It should be noted that renegotiation of the
250 terms for dismissal through use of amendments from the floor of presbytery would invalidate
251 months of work between the PRT and the congregation. Therefore, the proposal shall be
252 presented as a whole, with the understanding that the final agreement has been reached by good
253 faith negotiations between the PRT and the congregation.

254
255 The PRT shall report the results of its meeting with the congregation, and the presbytery shall
256 determine whether the process for requesting dismissal was fair and represents the will of the
257 congregation. If so, the congregation shall be dismissed to another Reformed denomination,
258 subject to any agreements that may be reached regarding the fair treatment of those members
259 who do not wish to leave the denomination. If the presbytery determines that the request for
260 dismissal was invalid, the request for dismissal should be denied, and the congregation shall
261 remain a member of the PC(USA), and, ordinarily, no further action should be taken to
262 reconsider the matter for at least 24 months.

263 264 FINANCIAL GUIDELINES

265
266 The financial guidelines that are a part of this document are still being worked on in committee
267 and will be provided for presbytery consideration when they become available.

268 269 OTHER PROVISIONS

270
271 If a congregation or its leadership preemptively files suit in a civil court against the presbytery,
272 the Presbytery of Santa Barbara may answer the suit. The presbytery may seek to preserve its
273 assets and assert its rights.

274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284

If the staff or session of a congregation has initiated specific, concrete action to withdraw from this presbytery or the PC(USA), without prior consultation with the presbytery and the initiation of the above-described process, the presbytery may initiate an administrative commission. Such actions could include, but are not limited to, calling a meeting of members of the congregation to discuss the church's withdrawal from the denomination or the session voting to move toward membership in another denomination. The presbytery, at its next stated or called meeting, whichever occurs first, may appoint an administrative commission to address the situation at that church and attempt to modify the church's activities to follow the processes described above. The administrative commission may be granted any authority permitted in the Book of Order.